

**Ingham County Apportionment Commission**  
**MINUTES**  
**May 9, 2011**

The Ingham County Apportionment Commission met on Monday, May 9, 2011. The meeting was held in the Third Floor, Board of Commissioner Room, in the Veteran's Memorial Courthouse. The meeting was called to order by Clerk Bryanton at 12:05 p.m. and introductions were made.

**MEMBERS PRESENT:** Mike Bryanton, Ingham County Clerk  
Stuart J. Dunning, III, Ingham County Prosecuting Attorney  
Eric Schertzing, Ingham County Treasurer  
Linda Lee Tarver, Ingham County Republican Party  
Sandy Zerkle, Ingham County Democratic Party

**MEMBERS ABSENT:** None

**OTHERS PRESENT:** Janie Lee, Ingham County Chief Deputy Clerk  
John Schlinker, Ingham County Chief Deputy Treasurer  
Dave Stoker, Ingham County Corporation Counsel  
Scott Hughes, Ingham County Prosecutors office  
Doug Stover, Ingham County Equalization Department  
Alan Fox, Chair, County Board of Canvassers  
Chris Swope, Lansing City Clerk  
Vince Dragonetti, County Commissioner  
Debbie DeLeon, County Commissioner  
Kris Zawisza, Women's League of Voters  
Nicole Evans, East Lansing City Clerk  
Deb Nolan, County Commissioner  
Robert Kerr, County Citizen

**Approval of the Minutes**

Motion made by Treasurer Schertzing, seconded by Prosecutor Dunning, III, to adopt the April 11, 2011, minutes. MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY

**Correspondence and Communications**

Items under Correspondence and Communications were reviewed by committee. Motion made by Linda Lee Tarver, seconded by Prosecutor Dunning, III, to adopt the Correspondence and place on file. MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY

**Public Comment**

Commissioner Nolan addressed the Commission regarding her County Commissioner seat and requested to have the seat drawn more favorable towards Democrats. Dave Stoker addressed the issue and stated that partisanship cannot play a role in drawing the maps.

Clerk Swope addressed the board with his concerns about precinct lines. Clerk Swope he needs to send new voter registration cards to everyone in the City of Lansing, he also stated he wanted to redo the City's precinct lines so breaking precinct lines would not create any issues in the City of Lansing.

Dave Stoker addressed precinct splits. In 1982, the Supreme Court looked at breaking precinct lines and found it to be the least important standard. Discussion took place regarding precinct breaks.

Chris also, stated that the City has to redraw the Ward District lines this year. Chris presented the Commission with two different scenarios for Commissioner Districts. The first plan doesn't put Lansing with any other jurisdictions. Chris stated there is an unpopulated area of Lansing Township that could be combined with the East Lansing and part of Delhi, in that plan Meridian would be cut into 2 districts. Lansing Township, Delhi and East Lansing would be the only breaks the other Townships would be whole. In plan 2, East Lansing and Meridian could be combined. Chris said Meridian would have to be moved into another district. Lansing and Lansing Township would have 6 Districts. Both plans are based on 14 seats the Commission is looking at.

Alan Fox addressed the Commission regarding history on past Apportionments.

Commissioner DeLeon addressed the Commission asking why the Commission wants to reduce the number of Commissioner Seats. Commissioner DeLeon states she feels the 16 member Commission works. She states the cost saving is not significant enough to make a difference in the budget. She feels that no current Commissioners would like a primary and she doesn't understand why we chose 14 Commissioner Districts.

Chairperson Bryanton addressed Commissioner DeLeon's concerns stating every department in the County has been asked to make budget cuts and the Commissioners have made little cuts to their budget. He stated he knows the Commissioners are limited to what they can do but feels it is important for the Commissioners to show they are doing their part. He also stated the Commissioners could give up 2 seats through attrition.

Linda Lee Tarver stated she agreed that the 14 Commissioner Districts were appropriate with the current state of the budget. Linda also, stated she feels it is important to have diversity represented in the County.

Commissioner Dragonetti addressed the Commission stating the two proposed maps have strong differences in voters. He also agreed that the Commissioners need to do their part in making budget cuts along with the other departments in the County.

Kris Zawisza, Womens League of Voters, addressed the Commission stating she is there to represent the people in the County. She feels it is important to keep like communities together.

Robert Kerr addressed the Commission stating this should not be a political process and it should be a computer generated map. He feels mixing up the districts and bringing different communities together is a great idea.

### **Old Business**

Dave Stoker stated he reviewed the 2 maps as requested by the Commission. He stated it is impossible to meet all of the criteria to make the maps work. He discussed a 1982 Wayne County case and a 1992 Clinton County case.

Doug Stover discussed the precinct and jurisdictional splits in the three maps.

Map 1 has 4 precinct splits	5 jurisdictional splits
Map 2 has 0 precinct splits	7 jurisdictional splits
Current map had 4 precinct splits	4 jurisdictional splits

Prosecutor Dunnings, III requested to have the maps defined with stronger municipal boundaries.

Doug Stover passed out CD's and directions on how to retrieve the 2010 Census data from the State's website.

### **New Business**

Linda Lee Tarver presented a map to the Commission for review. Moved by Linda Lee Tarver, seconded by Chairperson Bryanton, to accept and forward map to Doug Stover to place the map in the same format as maps 1 and 2. Discussion followed. MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY

Meeting was recessed at 1:30 p.m. due to a tornado drill in the building.

Meeting reconvened at 1:44 p.m.

Discussion took place regarding Commissioner Dougan going directly to Doug Stover to work on a map for Commissioner Dougan. At an earlier meeting Doug was instructed to report those request to the Commission. Linda Lee Tarver said she met with the Republican members of the Board of Commissioners to discuss a map. She had no knowledge that Commissioner Dougan went to Doug directly. Chairperson Bryanton wanted the minutes to reflect that Commissioner Dougan tried to circumvent the process.

Discussion took place regarding the map Linda Lee Tarver presented to the Commission. Linda also wanted to remind the Commission not to judge the map based on Commissioner Dougan and his actions.

Discussion took place regarding Linda Lee Tarver's map appearing to be "party baseline". Linda Lee Tarver explained she used the Republican party software to create the map but she did not use partisan data to draft the map.

Prosecutor Dunnings, III presented a 14 district map to the Commission. Motion made by Prosecutor Dunnings, III, seconded by Chairperson Bryanton, to accept and forward map to Doug Stover to place the map in the same format as maps 1 and 2. Discussion followed. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Prosecutor Dunnings, III started comparing the current Commissioner map to the map he presented and the district numbers were not matching up. Prosecutor Dunnings, III stated he would get this information to the Commission at a later date. The map Prosecutor Dunnings, III presented only had 2 precinct breaks, one including non-populated, Meridian Township would have 2 fewer jurisdictional breaks.

Discussion took place regarding placing dots on the new proposed maps of where the current Commissioners live. Dave Stoker suggested this was not a good legal move.

The Commission directed Doug Stover to enlarge map 1's precincts to be placed on the Clerk's webpage. The Commission was instructed to contact Alan Fox for the map presented by Prosecutor Dunnings, III and Linda Lee Tarver for the map she presented.

Moved by Treasurer Dunnings, III, seconded by Chairperson Bryanton, for the Commission to not accept any other maps for review. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

Moved by Chairperson Bryanton, Seconded by Sandy Zerkle, to remove map 2 from further consideration. MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY

### **Public Comment**

Nicole Evans, East Lansing City Clerk, introduced herself to the Commission.

### **Adjournment**

Next meeting will be held Monday, May 23, 2011, at Noon, Veteran's Memorial Courthouse, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor, Board of Commissioners room.

There being no further business the meeting was adjourned at 2:08 p.m. Moved by Prosecutor Dunnings, III, supported by Linda Lee Tarver. MOTION PASSED UNANIMOUSLY.